A Peek into Data Published by Customs Agencies: a First Look at Reporting Practices and Policy Implications

- Ari Finnsson, University of Toronto and Senior Research Assistant at Borders in Globalization
- Emmanuel Brunet-Jailly, University of Victoria

Wide Range

 Currently 85 Customs Agencies surveyed worldwide

Data Collection

Narrow Scope

- Focus on data reporting from Customs Agencies only
- Starting with customs enforcement data, other datasets to follow
 - Seizures of banned commodities
 - Control of movement of people

Data Collection

- Goal: to compare how data is reported by customs agencies globally
 - Only data published by customs agencies, no other government bodies
 - Focus is on how the data is reported:
 - What commodity seizures are reported?
 - What units are used?
 - How often are reports published?

Data Collection

Example Customs
Agency report:
Canada

Total number of seizures by quarter for fiscal year 2021 to 2022

| All commodities | First quarter | Second quarter | Third quarter | Fourth quarter | Year-to-date total |
|-----------------|---------------|----------------|---------------|----------------|--------------------|
| Total seizures | 11,846 | 16,495 | 11,297 | 12,711 | 52,349 |

Quantity of goods seized, by quarter for fiscal year 2021 to 2022

| Selected commodities | Unit of measure | First quarter | Second quarter | Third quarter | Fourth quarter | Total | | |
|--------------------------------------|-----------------|---------------|----------------|---------------|----------------|------------|--|--|
| Drugs | | | | | | | | |
| Cannabis products 1 | Grams | 3,049,528 | 7,452,399 | 3,328,205 | 2,303,823 | 16,133,955 | | |
| Hashish | Grams | 7,107 | 1,273 | 15,286 | 4,922 | 28,588 | | |
| Cocaine/Crack 2 | Grams | 522,950 | 201,355 | 336,887 | 1,813,961 | 2,875,152 | | |
| Heroin | Grams | 56,263 | 26,148 | 34,143 | 170,984 | 287,537 | | |
| Fentanyl | Grams | 1 | 304 | 73 | 185 | 563 | | |
| Other opioids 3 | Grams | 9,638 | 27,554 | 110,261 | 2,653,511 | 2,800,964 | | |
| | Dosage | 0 | 0 | 59 | 0 | 59 | | |
| Other narcotics, drugs and chemicals | Grams | 2,780,822 | 7,254,282 | 5,156,921 | 7,286,025 | 22,478,050 | | |
| | ml | 3,429,648 | 1,274,965 | 24,428 | 2,414,004 | 7,143,045 | | |
| | Dosage | 627,703 | 174,845 | 214,359 | 337,741 | 1,354,649 | | |

Data Collection

- Canada reports data on:
 - Drugs categorized as:
 - Cannabis products
 - Hashish
 - Cocaine/Crack
 - Heroin
 - Fentanyl
 - Other opioids
 - Other narcotics, drugs, and chemicals
 - Number of seizures of all controlled commodities
 - Per quarter and total per year
 - Weight and/or volume of seized commodities
 - Per quarter and total per year

85 countries researched

- 34 no data from customs agency
- <u>11 potential data</u> but unable to translate
- 40 with data reported
- 31 Customs Agencies with data included in this report (<u>9 South American</u> countries with data are yet to be compiled into the report)

Geographic spread:

- Europe: 39 countries, 18 with data
- Asia: 13 countries, 5 with data
- Africa: 9 countries, 1 with data
- North America: 2 countries, 2 with data
- Oceania: 2 countries, 2 with data
- Central and South America: 20 countries, 12 with data

Key result: approx. 50% of customs agencies consulted to this point publish data

 Customs enforcement data is inconsistently reported.

Of 40 with data:

- All report on commodity seizures
 - But significant differences exist in standards of reporting
 - Primary modes of data collection:
 - Annual reports
 - Published data tables
 - Press Releases
- Only 6 report on control of movement of people

South and Central American Customs Agencies researched but not compiled into this report (9):

- Guatemala
- Honduras
- Panama
- Colombia
- Peru
- Chile
- Brazil
- Bolivia
- Uruguay

Customs Agencies yet to be confirmed (11)

- Indonesia
- Belarus
- Bulgaria
- Croatia
- Greece
- Hungary
- North Macedonia
- Montenegro
- Russia
- Sweden
- Bangladesh

| Customs Agencies surveyed who | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|--------------|------------|--|--|--|--|--|
| do | do not report enforcement data (34) | | | | | | | |
| China | Lithuania | Nigeria | Belize | | | | | |
| India | Moldova | South Africa | Nicaragua | | | | | |
| South Korea | Poland | Ghana | Costa Rica | | | | | |
| Vietnam | Portugal | Uganda | Venezuela | | | | | |
| Andorra | Romania | Zimbabwe | Guyana | | | | | |
| Bosnia and Herzegovina | Serbia | Israel | Suriname | | | | | |
| Italy | Slovakia | Lebanon | Egypt | | | | | |
| Kosovo | Algeria | Mexico | | | | | | |
| Liechtenstein | Morocco | El Salvador | | | | | | |

Customs Agencies surveyed with reported data included in this report (31)

| Japan | Czechia | Luxembourg | Jordan |
|---------------|---------|----------------|--------|
| Philippines | Denmark | Malta | |
| Singapore | Estonia | Netherlands | |
| Turkey | Finland | Norway | |
| Canada | France | Switzerland | |
| United States | Germany | United Kingdom | |
| Albania | Iceland | Australia | |
| Austria | Ireland | Tunisia | |
| Belgium | Latvia | New Zealand | |

Commodities Seizures: Summary

Drug seizures:

- Most Common reported:
 - Cocaine: 27/31 countries reported
 - Cannabis: 26/31 countries reported
 - Heroin: 23/31 countries reported
 - Methamphetamine: 17/31 countries reported
 - MDMA/Ecstasy: 20/31 countries reported
- Most common units of measurement:
 - Weight/volume (30/31)
 - Philippines only agency that does not report weight/volume of seized drugs
 - Number of cases of seizure (9/31) see Table 2
 - Majority report drug seizures in overall annual reports; minority report drug seizures as a separate report
 - 9/31 report drugs seizures only in press releases per incident see Table 1

Commodities Seizures: Summary

- Drugs seizures reported in a variety of categories, see table 3:
 - Reported <u>individually</u> (21/31)
 - Single numbers reported for <u>composite groups</u>, (10/31) e.g.
 - Other Drugs
 - Opiates
 - Amphetamines and ecstasy
 - Other narcotics
 - Cocaine & Heroin
- Other seizure statistics:
 - Seized firearms and weapons: 20/31 countries reported
 - Counterfeit items/IP violations seizures: 18/31 countries reported
 - <50% of 31 with data reported:</p>
 - Seized currency/proceeds of crime
 - Tobacco and Alcohol seizures
 - Protected animal/plant species
 - Agricultural products

Commodity Seizures: Reports by Press Release

TABLE 1: CUSTOMS AGENCIES WHO RELEASE DATA BY PRESS RELEASE OF INDIVIDUAL VIOLATIONS/SEIZURES ONLY (NO CENTRAL REPORT) (9/31)

| Austria |
|-----------|
| Estonia |
| France |
| Malta |
| Australia |
| Tunisia |
| Argentina |
| Paraguay |
| Ecuador |

Commodity Seizures: Tables

Table 2: Customs Agencies reporting total number of cases of commodity seizure

| Agencies which report number of cases of seizure of common banned drugs (9/31) | Banned drugs reported by number of cases of seizure |
|--|---|
| Japan | Cannabis & components/derivatives; Amphetamines; Methamphetamines; Cocaine; Heroin; Ketamine; Ecstasy/MDMA; Psychotropic substances; Other narcotics; Designated Substances |
| Philippines | Cannabis & components/derivatives; Methamphetamines; Ketamine; Ecstasy/MDMA |
| Canada | Cannabis & components/derivatives; Cocaine; Heroin; Fentanyl; Opioids |
| United States | Cannabis; Cocaine; Heroin; Ketamine; Ecstasy/MDMA; Fentanyl; Methamphetamines; LSD; Khat |
| Ireland | Cannabis; Cocaine & Heroin; Amphetamines, Ecstasy and other |
| Netherlands | Cannabis & components/derivatives; Amphetamines; Methamphetamines; Cocaine; Heroin; Ecstasy/MDMA; Khat |
| Norway | Cannabis; Amphetamines; Cocaine; Heroin |
| United Kingdom | Cannabis & components/derivatives; Amphetamines; <u>Cocaine; Crack Cocaine; Heroin;</u> Fentanyl; Ketamine; Ecstasy/MDMA; LSD; Morphine; Steroids; GHB; methadone; barbiturates; Temazepam; Mephedrone; nitrous oxide |
| Turkey | Cocaine; Methamphetamine; Khat; Captagon; Opium |

Commodity Seizures: Tables

Table 3: Drug Reporting Categories

| Customs Agency | Drug categories |
|-------------------------|---|
| Japan | Psychotropic substances; Other narcotics; Designated Substances |
| Canada | Other narcotics, drugs, and chemicals |
| Belgium | Heroin & Opiates; Synthetic drugs (Amphetamines/LSD/Ecstasy) |
| Denmark | New Psychoactive Substances; Amphetamines & Ecstasy; Opiates; Medicines and Doping Substances |
| Ireland | Cocaine & Heroin; Ecstasy, Amphetamines & other |
| Luxembourg | Doping products; New Psychoactive Substances |
| Switzerland | Designer drugs; Dangerous pills |
| Turkey | Other Drugs |
| Jordan | Narcotics |
| United Kingdom | Crack cocaine reported separately from Cocaine |
| Remaining Agencies (21) | Drugs reported separately |

Commodities Seizures: Key Results

Where data is available:

- Number of cases of commodity violations/seizures <u>infrequently</u> reported by customs agencies
 - A minority of customs agencies publish data showing the <u>frequency</u> of violations
 - Lack of data impedes crossagency comparison of violations <u>frequency</u>

Commodities Seizures: Key Results

Where data is available:

- Although all but 1 customs agency reports weight/volume of seizures, cross-agency comparisons are complicated by different standards and methods of reporting
 - Seizure statistics of specific controlled commodities cannot be compared across differently grouped categories

Example: Jordan Anti-Smuggling Data report

- Large categories—ex. total Customs violations per year—give "big picture" report for the year
- But Data does not separate seizures into categories, cannot compare specific commodity seizure data

| | | Number of Cases | Amount of fines collected | Amount of drugs detected | |
|----------|--|-----------------|---------------------------|--------------------------|---|
| Duration | ration Smuggling Customs)I Collected Cases Violations | |)Million dinars(| | |
| 2021 | 44,554 | 4,267 | 40,287 | 25,0 | (9.5) million narcotic pills (1500) gm cocaine (20) kg of cereals (combs) for growing marijuana |
| 2020 | 37,871 | 4,773 | 33,098 | 14,0 | (375) kg |

^{*}Customs fines above are the total amounts actually paid during the year under financial receipts.

Example: United Kingdom Anti-Smuggling Report

Each
 commodity
 has data for
 volume and
 number of
 seizures per
 quarter from
 2011-present

| | А | В | С | D | E | F | G | Н | 1 | J | K | L |
|----|------------|----------------------------|------------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|------------|
| 4 | Drug Class | Drug type | Country | 2011-12 Q1 | 2011-12 Q2 | 2011-12 Q3 | 2011-12 Q4 | 2012-13 Q1 | 2012-13 Q2 | 2012-13 Q3 | 2012-13 Q4 | 2013-14 Q1 |
| 5 | Α | Cocaine (KG) | England | 1,511 | 578 | 349 | 495 | 1,151 | 279 | 460 | 526 | 830 |
| 6 | | | Northern Ireland | 1 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 |
| 7 | | | Scotland | 0 | 10 | 2 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 11 | 0 |
| 8 | | | Wales | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 9 | | | Total | 1,512 | 589 | 352 | 495 | 1,151 | 279 | 460 | 537 | 832 |
| 10 | Α | Crack (KG) | England | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 |
| 11 | | | Northern Ireland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 12 | | | Scotland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 13 | | | Wales | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 14 | | | Total | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 0 | 0 | 7 | 0 | 0 |
| 15 | Α | Diamorphine (Heroin) (KG) | England | 655 | 60 | 107 | 802 | 170 | 131 | 74 | 69 | 99 |
| 16 | | | Northern Ireland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6 | 0 |
| 17 | | | Scotland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 18 | | | Wales | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 19 | | | Total | 655 | 60 | 107 | 802 | 171 | 131 | 74 | 75 | 99 |
| 20 | Α | LSD (Dose 000s) | England | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 20 | 0 | 0 |
| 21 | | | Northern Ireland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 22 | | | Scotland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 23 | | | Wales | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 24 | | | Total | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 20 | 0 | 0 |
| 25 | Α | MDMA (Ecstasy) (Dose 000s) | England | 2 | 183 | 320 | 0 | 22 | 47 | 94 | 95 | 28 |
| 26 | | | Northern Ireland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 27 | | | Scotland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 28 | | | Wales | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 40 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 29 | | | Total | 2 | 183 | 320 | 0 | 62 | 47 | 94 | 95 | 28 |
| 30 | Α | Methadone (Dose 000s) | England | | | | | | | | | |
| 31 | | | Northern Ireland | | | | | | | | | |
| 32 | | | Scotland | | | | | | | | | |
| 33 | | | Wales | | | | | | | | | |
| 34 | | | Total | | | | | | | | | |
| 35 | Α | Morphine (Dose 000s) | England | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 36 | | | Northern Ireland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 37 | | | Scotland | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 38 | | | Wales | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 39 | | | Total | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 |
| 40 | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 11 | - | * 1 | | | | 252 | | 200 | 107 | 25 | 200 | |

Ireland Anti-Smuggling Report

- Drug violations reported in composite categories unique to this agency.
 - Cocaine & Heroin reported together; Ecstasy, Amphetamines & other reported as one category

Table 18: Drug Seizures

| Type of Drug | No. of Seizures | Quantity (kg) | Value (€m) |
|-------------------------------|-----------------|---------------|------------|
| Cannabis (Herbal & Resin) | 5,393 | 1,746 | 32.4 |
| Cocaine, Heroin | 174 | 912 | 71.7 |
| Amphetamines, Ecstasy & other | 15,596 | 3,083 | 10.7 |
| Total | 21,163 | 5,741 | 114.8 |

Control of Movement of people: Key results

Inconsistency in definitions of enforcement actions:

Cross country comparisons impossible without clear symmetry between categories of enforcement

| Customs Agency | Categories of Data Reported |
|----------------|---|
| Canada | RemovalsArrestsDetentions |
| United States | Nationwide Encounters and Apprehensions Total Credible Fear Inadmissibles Custody Statistics for SW Border and US Border Patrol locations Southwest Land Border Encounters Numbers for Expedited Removal & Reinstatement of Prior Orders of Removal Arrests |
| United Kingdom | Number of records in Migration Refusal Pool Foreign National Offenders released from prison Foreign National Offenders subject to deportation action FNOs removed under the Early Removal and Facilitated Returns Schemes People entering/leaving immigration detention Annual Numbers of Returns [with various subcategories, i.e. by type of return] |
| Switzerland | Number of cases of illegal residence Persons detained for whom an alert had been issued |
| Turkey | Illegal immigrants detected |
| Albania | Number of "Clandestines" detected |

Conclusions:

data
harmonization
is a policy
conundrum

- What commodity seizures are reported? varied types/varied definition
- What units are used? varied types
- How often are reports published?
 varied methods and irregularly

 Inconsistency of definitions requires work on alignment of (1) definition of data, (2) types of data, (3) types of units, and (4) types of publication outlets

Thank you!

A Peek into Data Published by Customs Agencies: a First Look at Reporting Practices and Policy Implications

Ari Finnsson, University of Toronto and
Senior Research Assistant at Borders in Globalization
Emmanuel Brunet-Jailly, University of Victoria,
Director, Borders in Globalization